English Teaching Journal and Research

Revised : December, 20th 2023 **Revised** : December, 20th 2023 **Published** : December, 20th 2023

THE EFFECT OF MULTIPLE-SLOT SUBSTITUTION DRILL IN TEACHING PRESENT CONTINUOUS TENSE TO IMPROVE STUDENTS' SPEAKING ACHIEVEMENT AT THE EIGHTH GRADE OF SMP IT ASY-SYADZILI PAKIS-MALANG

Muhammad Yasminto Antoenyaz83@gmail.com

M. Agus Susanto¹ mragussusanto9@gmail.com

Abstract

This study investigated students' speaking achievement on present continuous tense using multiple-slot substitution drill at the eighth grade students of SMP IT Asy-Syadzili Pakis-Malang. Designed used in this study was true experimental research conducted with one experimental group taught present continuous tense using multiple-slot substitution drill and control group without multiple-slot substitution drill. To collect the data, the researcher used speaking post-test in oral test form. In analyzing the data, the researcher used IBM spss statistic versions. 20 application of independent sample t.test to know the differences between experimental and control groups. After applying the statistical computation, it was found that the mean score of experimental group (X) in post-test 53.58 with standard deviation 3.951 was higher than the mean score of control group (Y) in post-test 41.57 with standard deviation 2.750. So it can be concluded that students taught present continuous tense using multiple-slot substitution drill achieve better than taught without multiple-slot substitution drill at the eighth grade students of SMP IT Asy-Syadzili Pakis-Malang.

Keywords: Multiple-Slot Substitution Drill, Present Continuous, Speaking Achievement.

A. INTRODUCTION

Learning English has become a demand in view of the development of information, communication, and technology today. Learning it definitely through

2, December 2023

Volume 3 No. 2, December 2023

¹ Magister Program of University of Islam, Malang

English Teaching Journal and Research

oral and written communication. Based on its use, English learners should master four skills which include listening, speaking, reading, and writing. In addition, aspects of language also need to be mastered which include vocabulary, pronunciation, grammar, and translation.

A researcher took the levels of English speaking, which include the novice, elementary, and intermediate levels. The novice level is characterized by the ability to communicate minimally with the learning materials. At the elementary level, students then produce oral utterances using isolated words and a few high-frequency phrases. The intermediate level is characterised by the two speaker's ability to combine learned elements, sustain in basic communicative tasks, ask and answer questions.²

By looking at those levels, English language learners at the lower secondary school level are still far from what is expected based on those as the target to achieve better speaking skill. The novice level is commonly learned by beginners learning English for the first time. The Elementary level is one level above novice, meaning that learners have higher English proficiency than beginners and so do learners of the intermediate level. Those levels have been created in such way and invited different interpretations. The materials that should be taught according to the standard of competence and basic competence seem that there is not enough time to practice it, especially in the context of learning to speak English for the level of the English proficiency of lower secondary school students. The time allocated in learning English in class is very short, twice a week. The students are required to focus on several lessons at school, which make it difficult for them to master English lesson, which are not their daily language.

In addition to the problem mentioned in the previous, the lack of student motivation is also an obstacle in learning English which can be found either in external motivation such as family, friends, and the environment; and internal motivation that comes from the students themselves who have not found the moment where they should learn English well and seriously. The next problem is

² H. Douglas Brown, *Teaching by principles an interactive approach to language pedagogy* (2nd ed.), (San Fransisco: San Fransisco State University, 2001), p. 100



English Teaching Journal and Research

that they perceive English as a difficult subject because of the lack of knowledge of the language that they got or learned at the previous grade and school level.

Speaking includes one of the very crucial English skills as a communicative ability, because the main target to learn English both formally and informally is to be able to communicate orally in English. The ability to speak English in the target language is the main goal stated in the curriculum, namely to develop the potential of students to have communicative competence in interpersonal, transactional, and functional discourse, using various spoken and written English texts, coherently using linguistic elements.

Every educator in the education unit is obliged to plan the complete and systematic implementation of learning (RPP) so that learning takes place in an interactive, inspiring, fun, challenging, motivating the students to participate actively, as well as providing ample space for innovation, creativity, and independence according to their talents, interests, and physical and psychological development of students.³ Speaking skill becomes very important in education field, in which the students need to be drilled in order to have a good communication skill in English.

In this study, a researcher focuses on language element in the use of the present continuous tense, which is taught to practice speaking skill as a substitute for grammar exercise. At the junior high school level in the EFL learners, the elements of language as a grammar lesson, are taught with speaking drill so that students are simultaneously able to speak English grammatically. The present continuous tense is a combination of the use of "to be" and "verb-ing" in its basic pattern. In addition, the use of pronouns as a pattern of followers "to be" also pays special attention in studying it. Finally, of course, the use of adverbs of time in marking the activity that is currently ongoing. The researcher who is also their English teacher had difficulty in giving understanding to them in teaching the present continuous tense. The following were the teacher's problems in teaching the

³ Ministry of Education and Culture, *The process standard*, (Jakarta: Depdikbud, 2013), No.65



English Teaching Journal and Research

present continuous to the eighth grade students of SMP IT Asy-Syadzili in the year academic of 2021-2022:

a. Student passivity to contribute further in the English learning process.
 This then has a lot of impact on the core activities of the lesson plan related to the realm of questioning or asking questions.

For example:

1. A teacher : What are you doing?

Students : studying, writing, reading, eating, and so forth.

The first example above is easy, because children had been given the examples of "verb-ing" through pictures, and they just needed to answer using "verb-ing" according to the pictures given.

2. A teacher : What are you doing?

Students : I studying, and so forth.

When they were required to answer the full sentence, they certainly had difficulty in practicing the tense sentence pattern that had been given. This was like it or not, a teacher had to teach them grammar one by one in the form of pronouns, to be, forms of "verb-ing", and the use of adverbs of time. It will take a lot of time to improve and increase their speaking ability grammatically.

b. Mastery of English vocabulary or students' vocabulary that is still small and limited.

For example:

They seemed still poor in vocabulary when they were asked to name everyday verbs where the teacher immediately used pictures to guess what activities they are. This is because their main target is to pass the mid-semester and final-semester written exams, so the teacher has a time limit to teach them speaking so that they get used to saying English vocabulary verbally.

Heterogeneous class that makes it difficult for an English teacher to teach the lesson. The number of students per class is also an obstacle, namely the mean of per class is 25 above, and there are even classes that number up to 31-32 students.



Teaching English in the context of language elements is certainly very difficult. The first thing that must be done before the teaching and learning process is classroom management, which will certainly take up a lot of learning time in class. Even the material presented is difficult to achieve. This requires the teacher to make 1 material with 2-3 meetings, and all the materials must be delivered before the final semester exam.

After seeing the existing problems and then considering several crucial problem that needed solution, the researcher took the initiative to teach the present continuous tense language elements with a technique of Multiple-Slot Substitution Drill. This technique is one of techniques of the Audio Lingual Method with repetition drill of words and sentences. A researcher wanted to apply speaking drill learning to the present continuous tense material. What is expected from the material is that students can speak grammatically using the present continuous tense. Multiple-slot substitution drill is similar with single-slot substitution drill. The difference is the teacher gives cue phrases, one at a time that fit into different slots in the dialog line. Students must recognize what part of speech each cue is, where it fits into the sentence, and make any other changes, such as subject-verb agreement based on the use of present continuous tense. They then say the line, fitting the cue phrase into the line where it belongs. Here is the example of using multiple-slot substitution drill in teaching present continuous tense:

A teacher : I am studying English now in the library Students : I am studying English now in the library

"Please substitute the words in the correct position. Like the example below:

A teacher : I am studying English now in the library (A teacher asks

> students to change the word "I" to become "she" during the repetition drill. (the word "she" can be in the form of

> the writing "she" on the paper shown or a picture of a girl))

Students : She is studying English now in the library

A teacher : I am studying English now in the library (A teacher asks

students to change the word "studying" to become

"reading" during the repetition drill.)



English Teaching Journal and Research

Students : I am **reading** English now in the library

A teacher : I am studying English now in the library (A teacher asks

students to change the word "now" to become "today"

during the repetition drill.)

Students : I am studying English today in the library.

A teacher : I am studying English now in the library (A teacher asks

students to change the phrase "in the library" to become

"in the classroom" during the repetition drill.)

Students : I am studying English now in the classroom

A teacher : I am studying English now in the library (A teacher asks

students to change the word "am" to become "am not /

negative" during the repetition drill.)

Students : I am not studying English now in the library. (Negative

statement)

A teacher : Are you studying English now in the library? (A teacher

asks students to change the word "you" to become "she"

during the repetition drill.)

Students : Is she studying English now in the library? (Interrogative

statement)

B. METHODS

In this study, the researcher used quantitative research with true experimental research method, because in this design, he controls all external variables that affect the course of the experiment. The experimental research method can be interpreted as a research method used to find the effect of certain treatments on others under controlled conditions.⁴ Experiment is considered an ideal approach for solving the educational problems, so, by relating the experimental design to this study, the researcher wanted to

⁴ Sugiyono, *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, R&D*, (Bandung: PT. Alphabet, 2016), p. 109



English Teaching Journal and Research

know whether the students taught present continuous tense using multiple-slot substitution drill achieve better speaking skill than those taught without using multiple-slot substitution drill at the eighth grade students of SMP IT Asy-Syadzili Pakis-Malang.

The researcher uses *systematic random sampling* in which every population has the same chance to be the sample. According to Widiyanto (2002:113), every population is given serial number, and the member of sample is choosen randomly by using the proportional principles. The proportional is determined based on the comparison count of population number with the number of sample needed.

The steps in determining sample with this technique are as follows:

- 1. identifying the whole member of population;
- 2. listing and giving serial number in every member of population;
- 3. determining the number of sample needed;
- 4. determining systematical proportion (k) by counting the comparation number of population with the number of sample needed:

$$(k = \frac{The Number\ of Population\ (N)}{The Number\ of\ Sample\ (n)});$$

- 5. randoming the member of population;
- 6. determining first serial number randomly that will be used as the first number to the arrangement of population to be started in sample choice;
- 7. from the first number having been determined before, every systematical proportion (k) are chosen as a sample;
- 8. repeating continuously until being able to be chosen all the members of sample needed.

The total population is 205 divided by the number of classes (8 classes) to 25,625 or rounded up to 26. The sample for this study was 26 for the experimental group and 26 for the control group with the total number of sample is 52 students. Sample chosen were conducted by listing the serial number from number 1 to 205, then sample is taken based on the number of multiples of four (4,8,12,16,20 until 129).

The writer collects data with several ways such as post-test, observation, documentation, and audio recording.



English Teaching Journal and Research

Post-test is conducted after doing treatment to the students. The treatment definitely uses the technique of multiple-slot substitution drill in teaching present continuous tense to the experimental group, while control with the traditional technique. A researcher asks the students one by one to perform in front of the class with the technique of multiple slot substitution drill. This test is a form of oral test and used to know the progress of the students' speaking performance.

Oral test measures salient features of speaking skill, they are: 1) grammar; 2) pronunciation; 3) vocabulary; 4) fluency. Four points scale are used to calculate the percentage of the items: 4 point for excellent; 3 points for good; 2 points for satisfactory; and 1 point for needs improvement.

It also includes speaking rubric to be followed by a researcher to measure salient features of speaking skill by using "iRubric: Grading Criteria for English Speaking Test Rubric".⁵

iRubric: Grading Criteria for English Speaking Test Rubric

	Needs	Catiafaatawy	Cood	Excellent	
	Improvement	•			
	1 pts	2 pts	3 pts	4 pts	
Grammar					
	Student was	Student was	Student was	Student was able	
	difficult to	able to express	able to express	to express their	
	understand and	their ideas and	their ideas and	ideas and	
	had a hard time	responses	responses	responses with	
	communicating	adequately but	fairly well but	ease in proper	
	their ideas and	often displayed	makes	sentence	
	responses	inconsistencies	mistakes with	structure and	
	because of	with their	their tenses,	tenses.	
	grammar	sentence	however is		
	mistakes.	structure and	able to correct		
		tenses.	themselves.		
Pronunciation					
	Student was	Student was	Pronunciation	Pronunciation	
	difficult to	slightly	was good and	was very clear	
	understand,	unclear with	did not	and easy to	
	quiet in	pronunciation	interfere with	understand.	
	speaking,	at times, but	communication		

⁵ https://www.rcampus.com/indexrubric.cfm

ETJAR

Volume 3 No. 2, December 2023

is <u>y</u> byudzin 1		lournal	and	Resear	ch
	I GHINNAN I	TAMITIMI		IIAAAAII	VII.

	unclear in	generally is		
	pronunciation.	fair.		
Vocabulary				
	inadequate vocabulary words to express his/her ideas properly, which hindered the students in responding.	able to use broad vocabulary	utilized the words learned in class, in an	
	slow, stumbling, nervous, and uncertain with response, except for short or memorized expressions. Difficult for a	hesitant and irregular. Sentences may be left	mostly smooth but with some hesitation and unevenness caused primarily by	Speech is effortless and smooth with speed that comes close to that of a native speaker.

3.3.2 Observation

A researcher uses an observation as data collection technique to know how the teaching of speaking with the material of present continuous tense through multiple-slot substitution drill, to know the development of students or how far this technique can help them achieve better speaking skill.

3.3.3 Documentation

Documentation is used by a researcher as a proof of the data in this study. The data can be the circumstances of the students, the circumstances of school environment and classroom, as well as the pictures of students' learning activities.

3.3.4 Audio Recording



Audio recording comes to help a researcher record the post-test in order that their speaking performance can be identified and measured.

The researcher makes the procedures in collecting data including treatment and post-test both for experimental and control group. In treatment, experimental students are taught present continuous tense using multiple-slot substitution drill, meanwhile control without multiple-slot substitution drill. Control are provided with traditional routine situation in the classroom. The researcher then plans the detail schedules of treatment, review and post-test as the material to conduct his research and finds the result of his study

To obtain the students' data on speaking achievement, The researcher makes oral test to find out how multiple-slot substitution drill is able to increase students' speaking achievement and whether students who are taught present continuous using multiple-slot substitution drill achieve better speaking skill than those without multiple-slot substitution drill. The researcher uses an oral test with 2 sentences, each containing 5 substitutions. Students' post-test score from both experimental and control group is analyzed through t-test. T-test is used to test the comparative hypothesis of two samples.

The analysis procedures are as follows:

1. Scoring Technique

The researcher uses test rubric to measure speaking skill adapted by "iRubric: Grading Criteria for English Speaking Test Rubric" as stated in the research instrument.

2. T-test

T-test is used for comparative hypothesis of two samples if the data is in interval or ratio. It aims to compare if the students' scores of the test from both experimental and control group are significantly different. By using t-test formula the researcher calculates the students' post-test scores from experimental and control group. The terms in using t-test should be in normal distribution and homogenous variants.

To examine whether it is significant or not, data analysis of this research is using IBM SPSS STATISTIC Versions.20 application of independent sample t.test



English Teaching Journal and Research

to know the differences between experimental group taught present continuous tense using multiple-slot substitution drill and control without multiple-slot substitution drill.

C. FINDINGS

Based on the data obtained from the mean scores of post-test with two groups, the lowest score of the students who were in experimental group was 49, and the highest was 63, while the lowest score of the students who were in the control group was 35, the highest was 46.

Table 4.1. Calculation of the mean scores using SPSS Group Statistics

Report

	posttest_exp	posttest_cont
	eriment	rol
Mean	53.58	41.27
N	26	26
Std. Deviation	3.951	2.750

Then the calculation of the data had conducted in which resulted the mean (mean) score of each group. The mean score of experimental group (X) in post-test was 53,58 with standard deviation was 3.951. Meanwhile, the mean score of control group (Y) in post-test 41.27 with standard deviation was 2.750.

The writer assumed there was a significant difference between the result of the teaching present continuous tense using multiple-slot substitution drill on students' speaking achievement and without multiple-slot substitution drill on students' speaking achievement at the eighth grade students of SMP IT Asy-Syadzili Pakis-Malang.

Hypothesis is formal statement about expected relationship between two or more variables which can be tested through an experiment.



English Teaching Journal and Research

Hypothesis constitutes a temporal answer or a weak answer where the truth remains to be proved. Therefore, the hypothesis proposed in this research remains to be proved. However, the alternative hypothesis (Ha) should be change into null hypothesis first. In testing hypothesis Ha must be changed into Ho.⁶

To test the hypothesis, t-test used was with the level of significance 0.05 (5%).

- 1) Formulating the null hypothesis (Ho): there is no significant mean difference between variable X and variable Y
- 2) Formulating the alternative hypothesis (Ha): there is a significant mean difference between variable X and Y.

For further information. The writer followed assumptions below:

- 1) If p < .05, null hypothesis (Ho) is rejected.
- 2) If p > .05, null hypothesis (Ho) is accepted.

Table 4.2. Calculation of Independent Sample T-test

Independent Samples Test Levene's Test t-test for Equality of Means for Equality of Variances df Std. Error 95% Confidence Sig. Sig. (2-Mean Difference tailed) Difference Interval of the Difference Lower Upper Equal 6.436 .014 13.035 50 variances .000 12.308 .944 10.411 14.204 assumed Results Equal 13.035 44.619 .000 12.308 .944 10.406 14.210 variances not assumed

Table 4.2 shows the value of p (sig. 2-tailed) .000 < .05 at the level significance of df = N-2= 52-2= 50. It means that students taught present continuous tense using multiple-slot substitution drill achieve better speaking skill than students taught present continuous tense without using multiple-slot substitution

Volume 3 No. 2, December 2023
Volume 3 No. 2, December 2023

-- ISSN 2808-3318

⁶ Widiyanto., & Mikha Agus, Statistika terapan. Konsep & Aplikasi SPSS/LISREL dalam penelitian pendidikan, psikologi & ilmu sosial, (Jakarta: PT. Elex Media Komputindo, 2013), p. 67.

English Teaching Journal and Research

drill at the eighth grade students of SMP IT Asy-Syadzili Pakis-Malang. So, the null hypothesis was rejected

Discussion

Techniques plays an important role in the teaching of English, especially speaking skill. It is a planned and systematic effort for the English teacher to establish sequence in the various parts of the teaching. To teach speaking, a teacher is expected to provide students with sufficient practice to accustom them to use the target language in term of communicating intentions, reacting to other person and situations, and influencing other human beings.

Multiple-slot substitution drill is the technique designed in boasting and developing students' speaking skill with the objectives are to ensure students speak grammatically, and ensure them speak in accurate sentence. Due to its importance in our daily life and to improve the standard of English, it is necessary to conduct a study for approving a suitable technique for teaching English speaking at junior high school level, in which English is the language of science and technology.

Both experimental and control groups were given the different techniques of teaching speaking. Experiment was taught present continuous tense using multiple-slot substitution drill, while control was using routine/daily technique. Comparison between mean scores of experimental and control groups in post-test with the result obtained from the statistical analysis showed that there is a significant difference existed between the two groups with respect to post-test.

The performance of the experimental group was significantly better than that of the control group in post-test. The difference between two means was significant at 0.05 level. Thus, the null hypothesis that "there is no significant difference between mean scores of experimental and control groups on post-test," was rejected at 0.05 level.

Multiple-slot substitution drill technique used by experimental group achieves better than routine technique taught at school used in control. The finding supports Larsen Freeman and Marti Anderson (2011:48) that states in multiple-slot substitution drill, the students must recognize the parts of speech each



English Teaching Journal and Research

words/phrases which the teacher gives before to substitute into the sentence and make any other changes, such as subject verb agreement.

The finding also supports Khetaguri & Albay in Yuriatson (2018:57) stating that substitutions drill is an effective teaching one to develop not only the students' speaking ability (pronunciation) but also writing one (tenses). Related to the use of the teaching technique in this research, it helped students build their insight up to construct English sentences correctly or grammatically.

The next finding supports the views of Larsen-Freeman in Pujiana (2019:29) that states the advantages of substitution drill are:

- a. The students can recognize the part of speech and change it into sentence; and
- b. This drill is easily for the students because in this activity, the students still listen only one word/phrase (cue) from the teacher.

It is necessary to use a suitable technique and learning material in teaching speaking, so based on the technique, the findings significantly support the views Nurul (2018:75-76) that states multiple-slot substitution drill technique has a positive role in improving the speaking skills of 8th grade students of SMP N 7 Metro with an average score of post-test (after treatment) of 76.07 which is better than the pre-test (before treatment) of 61.6, and Pujiana (2019:58) who concluded that students taught simple present tense using multiple-slot substitution drill got better than those who were not, and stated that multiple-slot substitution drills got better than those who were not. Multiple-slot substitution drill is appropriate in teaching tenses.

Another theory which is supported by the finding is Harmer (2002:57) that suggests a teacher needs to match the task we ask to students to perform with their language level. It might make students reluctant to talk in class. Sometimes, this may have to do with students' own characters. It is also sometimes because there are other students who dominate and almost intimidate. In line with this, Harmer (2003:42) suggests to try the following activities: (1) using pair-work; it will help to provoke quiet students into talking. When they are in pairs or a small group, they are not under so much pressure as they are if asked to speak in front of the whole



English Teaching Journal and Research

class, (2) allowing them to speak in a controlled way at first; it may be a good idea to let students write down what they are going to say before they say it, (3) using 'acting out'; Getting students to act out dialogues is one way of encouraging quiet students.

For speaking grammatically, this study supports Larsen, Diane, and Freeman (2001:45) that states Grammar is induced from the examples given, explicit grammar rules are not provided by teacher. Students' reading and written work is based upon the oral work they did earlier.

From some of the statements above, and related to the objective of this study, the material of present continuous tense is grammar lesson. However, it is better if it is taught by speaking practice using multiple-slot substitution drill, which will quickly hone children's ability to repeat sentences, replace existing words in the sentence, improve vocabulary memory, and of course familiarize students to speak grammatically

D. CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

Conclusion

From the statistical analysis it was found that the mean score and the standard deviation of experimental groups were higher than control groups. It was proved with the mean score and the standard deviation of experimental group were 53.58 and 3.951, while the mean score of control group was 41.27 and the standard deviation was 2.750.

All of the above data indicates the experimental group is more successful than the control group. It means teaching present continuous tense using multiple-slot substitution drill achieves better than without using multiple-slot substitution drill. It can be seen from the result of computation. It indicates that p value shows .000 < .05 at the level significance of df = 50. The data shows that there is a significant difference between students taught present continuous using multiple-slot substitution drill and without using multiple-slot substitution drill on their speaking achievement..



English Teaching Journal and Research

The students should have some efforts to learn present continuous using multiple-slot substitution drill and they should practice speaking much grammatically accurate sentences based on tenses.

Suggestions

Based on those findings above, here the writer tries to give the solution of those findings that have been problems in teaching present continuous using multiple-slot substitution drill on students' speaking achievement. He gives these following suggestions that are addressed underneath:

For the Students

- 1) The students should have some efforts to learn present continuous tense by using multiple-slot substitution drill to improve their speaking achievement because when the students use this technique, they can be easier and more effective to study and can help them to make the sentence correctly.
- 2) The students should be more pay attention to their English teacher.
- 3) The students should be on time when they come to the class *For the English Teacher*
- 1) The English teacher has to make variety techniques in teaching learning process. As the technique, multiple-slot substitution drill is suggested to be used by English teacher to apply in his/her English speaking teaching.
- 2) The study is suggested that the English teacher can be more active and pay more attention to his/her students in learning English speaking, which concern to get high target in teaching English especially in speaking skill.
- 3) The teacher should always improve his or her skills and knowledge in exploring the class.

For other researchers

1) The researcher recommends the other researchers to develop their techniques by using multiple-slot substitution drill in teaching present continuous that can improve students' speaking ability.



English Teaching Journal and Research

2) To the other researchers who are interested for advance research, they can use this research to enrich the references about teaching present continuous tense by using multiple-slot substitution drill on students' speaking achievement.

English Teaching Journal and Research

- Brown, H. Douglas. (2001). Teaching by principles an interactive approach to language pedagogy (2nd ed). San Fransisco: State University.
- Freeman, Larsen. (1986). *Techniques and Principles in Language Teaching*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Harmer, J. (2002). The practice of English language teaching. London: Longman.
- https://www.rcampus.com/indexrubric.cfm.
- Khasanah, Nurul. (2018). The Use of Multiple-Slot Substitution Drill Technique

 To Increase The Student's Speaking Performance at The Eighth Grade of

 SMP N 7 Metro. Undergraduate thesis, IAIN Metro.
- Khetaguri, T & Albay, M. (2016). The Use of Drills in the Development of Speaking Skills. The Effect of Using Substitution Drill on Students' Tenses Mastery. International Journal of Social Sciences & Educational Studies Vol.3, No.1.
- Ministry of Education and Culture, (2013). *The process standard*. Jakarta: Depdikbud, No.65.
- Pujiana. (2019). The Effectiveness of Multiple-Slot Substitution Drill in Teaching Simple Present Tense at MTs Y.P. K.H. Syamsuddin Durisawo Ponorogo. Undergraduate thesis, IAIN Ponorogo.
- Sugiyono, (2016). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, R&D*. Bandung: PT. Alphabet.
- Widiyanto, & Mikha Agus. (2013). Statistika terapan: konsep & aplikasi spss/lisrel dalam penelitian pendidikan, psikologi & ilmu sosial. Jakarta: PT. Elex Media Komputindo.